

Northwest Territories   
Legislative Assembly

2nd Session Day 40 18th Assembly

HANSARD

Tuesday, November 1, 2016

Pages 1295 – 1322

**The Honourable Jackson Lafferty, Speaker**

**Legislative Assembly of the Northwest Territories**

Members of the Legislative Assembly

Speaker

Hon. Jackson Lafferty

(Monfwi)

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Hon. Glen Abernethy

(Great Slave)

Government House Leader

Minister of Health and Social Services  
Minister Responsible for the Workers’ Safety and Compensation Commission

Minister Responsible for Seniors

Minister Responsible for Persons with Disabilities

Minister Responsible for the Public Utilities Board

Mr. Tom Beaulieu

(Tu Nedhe-Wiilideh)

Mr. Frederick Blake

(Mackenzie Delta)

**Hon. Caroline Cochrane**

(Range Lake)

Minister of Municipal and Community

Affairs

Minister Responsible for Northwest

Territories Housing Corporation

Minister Responsible for the Status of

Women

Lead Responsibility for Addressing

Homelessness

**Ms. Julie Green**

(Yellowknife Centre)

Hon. Bob McLeod

(Yellowknife South)

Premier

Minister of Executive

Minister of Aboriginal Affairs and Intergovernmental Relations

Hon. Robert McLeod

(Inuvik Twin Lakes)

Deputy Premier

Minister of Finance

Minister of Environment and Natural

Resources

Minister of Human Resources

Lead Responsibility for Infrastructure

Mr. Daniel McNeely

(Sahtu)

Hon. Alfred Moses

(Inuvik Boot Lake)

Minister of Education, Culture and

Employment

Minister Responsible for Youth

Mr. Michael Nadli

(Deh Cho)

Mr. Herbert Nakimayak

(Nunakput)

Mr. Kevin O’Reilly

(Frame Lake)

Hon. Wally Schumann

(Hay River South)

Minister of Industry, Tourism and

Investment

Minister of Public Works and Services

Minister of Transportation

Hon. Louis Sebert

(Thebacha)

Minister of Justice

Minister of Lands

Minister Responsible for the Northwest

Territories Power Corporation

Minister Responsible for Public

Engagement and Transparency

Mr. R.J. Simpson

(Hay River North)

Mr. Kieron Testart

(Kam Lake)

Mr. Shane Thompson

(Nahendeh)

Mr. Cory Vanthuyne

(Yellowknife North)

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Officers

Clerk of the Legislative Assembly

Mr. Tim Mercer

Deputy Clerk

Mr. Doug SchauertePrincipal Clerk, Committees and Public Affairs

Mr. Michael BallPrincipal Clerk,   
Corporate and Interparliamentary Affairs

Ms. Cayley Thomas (Acting)Law Clerks

Ms. Sheila MacPherson

Mr. Glen Rutland

Ms. Alyssa Holland

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Box 1320

Yellowknife, Northwest Territories

Tel: (867) 767-9010 Fax: (867) 920-4735 Toll-Free: 1-800-661-0784

<http://www.assembly.gov.nt.ca>

**Published under the authority of the Speaker of the Legislative Assembly of the Northwest Territories**

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**PRAYER 1295**

**REPORTS OF STANDING AND SPECIAL COMMITTEES 1295, 1299**

**RECOGNITION OF VISITORS IN THE GALLERY 1298**

**TABLING OF DOCUMENTS 1313**

**CONSIDERATION IN COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE OF BILLS AND OTHER MATTERS 1313**

**REPORT OF COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE 1314**

**THIRD READING OF BILLS 1321**

Bill 11 – Supplementary Appropriation Act (Operations Expenditures), No. 1, 2016-2017 1321

**ORDERS OF THE DAY 1321**

**YELLOWKNIFE, NORTHWEST TERRITORIES**

**Tuesday, November 1, 2016**

**Members Present**

Hon. Glen Abernethy, Mr. Beaulieu, Mr. Blake, Ms. Green, Hon. Robert McLeod, Mr. McNeely, Hon. Alfred Moses, Mr. Nadli, Mr. Nakimayak, Mr. O'Reilly, Hon. Wally Schumann, Hon. Louis Sebert, Mr. Simpson, Mr. Testart, Mr. Thompson, Mr. Vanthuyne

The House met at 3:00 p.m.

# Prayer

---Prayer

**SPEAKER (Hon. Jackson Lafferty):** Good afternoon again, colleagues. We have had some technical issues, so we're using new technical microphones here. So whenever you're speaking, wait until your light goes on and then proceed from there. Item 2, Ministers' statements. Item 3, Members' statements. Item 4, reports of standing and special committees. Member for Kam Lake.

# Reports of Standing and Special Committees

## Committee Report 3-18(2): Report on the Review of the 2014-2015 Northwest Territories Human Rights Commission Annual Report

**MR. TESTART:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It is my pleasure to present Committee Report 3-18(2), Standing Committee on Government Operations Report of the Review of the 2014-2015 Northwest Territories Human Rights Commission Annual Report.

**Introduction**

The Standing Committee on Government Operations (the committee) has completed its review of the 2014-2015 Northwest Territories Human Rights Commission (the commission) Annual Report. The standing committee would like to thank Mr. Charles Dent, Chair of the Northwest Territories Human Rights Commission (the commission), and Ms. Deborah McLeod, director of Human Rights, for their appearance before the committee on June 13, 2016. Thank you. I would now like to hand it off to my colleague, Member for Sahtu.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Member for Sahtu.

**MR. MCNEELY:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**2014-2015 Annual Report**

**About the Human Rights Commission**

The Northwest Territories Human Rights Act sets up three independent but interrelated branches: the commission, the Office of the Director of Human Rights, and the Adjudication panel.

The Human Rights Commission is made up of three to five members of the public, each for a term of four years. They are appointed by and responsible to the Legislative Assembly for the general administration of the act. For the fiscal year in question, Mr. Charles Dent served as Chair of the Human Rights Commission and Mr. Yacub Adam as deputy chair. The remaining members of the commission were Ms. Marion Berls, Ms. Gerri Sharpe and Ms. Bronywn Watters.

The Director of Human Rights position is also appointed by the Legislative Assembly. The director is responsible for the administration of the complaints process and for overseeing administrative support for the commission’s outreach and education efforts. The Office of the Director of Human Rights includes the director, Ms. Deborah McLeod, and commission staff members who are members of the public service.

The adjudication panel hears complaints referred by the director, as well as appeals of the director’s decisions to dismiss complaints. The adjudication panel is composed of at least three lawyers appointed by the Legislative Assembly, each for a term of two to four years. In 2014-2015 the adjudication panel was chaired by Mr. Adrian Wright. The remaining adjudication panel members were Mr. Sheldon Toner, Mr. Louis Sebert, Mr. Colin Baile, and Ms. Kerry Penney.

The Committee wishes to thank the members of the commission and the adjudication panel for their service in 2014-2015. Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I would now like to hand it over to my colleague, Member for Deh Cho, Mr. Nadli.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Member for Kam Lake.

**MR. TESTART:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. If I may have a moment, Mr. Speaker? Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**Community Outreach and Public Awareness**

The commission celebrated the 10th Anniversary of the Northwest Territories Human Rights Act in 2014. Tenth anniversary celebrations included a kick-off luncheon, a show-and-tell contest, a fall colouring contest and an anti-bullying tour of four communities with Rob “KASP” Sawan, an Aboriginal hip-hop artist and anti-bullying advocate.

Other community outreach activities included: attendance at trade shows in Yellowknife, Fort Smith and Hay River; visits to a number of communities; outreach to the Inuvik Rainbow Club and participation in the third annual NWT Pride Festival in support of the rights of lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgendered persons.

The third annual Accessibility Award was given to the Tlicho Government for their new buildings in Gameti and Whati, which were designed to be accessible to persons with disabilities. The commission also maintains an online presence through its Facebook page and website.

**Complaints and Inquiries**

The standing committee took note of a printing error on page 18 of the Human Rights Commission’s 2014-2015 Annual Report. The chart for the number of inquiries by region mistakenly showed the figures from the previous year’s annual report.

Using amended information provided by the commission prior to the public hearing, the committee was advised that a total of 313 inquiries were received by the director’s office in 2014-2015, 14 fewer than in the previous year. The breakdown of complaints by region is as follows: North Slave - 150; South Slave - 24; Beaufort Delta - 31; Sahtu - 13; Deh Cho – 9; Tlicho - 5; Camps - 24; Outside NWT - 8; and Unknown – 49.

There were 38 complaints outstanding at the beginning of the fiscal year. To this, 32 new complaints were opened in 2014-2015. Of the 70 total complaints, 12 were settled, six were referred for adjudication, 12 were dismissed, and seven were withdrawn. Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I would now like to hand this off to the Member for Hay River North.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Member for Hay River North.

**MR. SIMPSON:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**Grounds for Complaint**

The Northwest Territories Human Rights Act protects people from discrimination in employment, public services, tenancy, membership in a trade union or professional association, and in publications. The act also protects against harassment based on a protected ground, or retaliation for participating in a complaint. The protected grounds under the act are listed on page 20 of the annual report.

A single complaint may allege discrimination on more than one ground. Disability is the most common ground for complaint, ten complaints alleged discrimination on the basis of disability in 2014-2015. Race was the next most common ground for complaint, and was alleged as the basis for eight complaints.

**Adjudication**

Complaints that cannot be dismissed at an early stage or resolved through mediation are referred to the adjudication panel for a hearing. The panel may determine if discrimination occurred and decide on an appropriate remedy. The adjudication panel started the year with 10 outstanding files: six complaints and four appeals of the director's decision. There were six new complaints referred by the director.

The adjudication panel decided one complaint and one appeal in 2014-2015. One appeal was withdrawn, leaving the panel with 13 files outstanding at year-end. All hearings are public and can be viewed at the adjudication panel's website at http://hrap.nt.ca.

**Comprehensive Review of the NWT Human Rights Act**

The Human Rights Commission contracted an independent review of the Human Rights Act which came into force in 2004. The outcome of that work is detailed in a report by J.J. Llewellyn, J.G. Sinclair and G.J. Hashey titled "Northwest Territories Human Rights Act Comprehensive Review." This report, posted on the commission's website, recommends moving from a strictly formal, judicially-based approach, which has a tendency to be adversarial and costly, to one that is more restorative in nature.

A restorative approach considers the whole context of an issue and encourages those involved to work together on a solution rather than assigning blame. In this way, a restorative approach provides an opportunity for the parties to repair their relationship and to build compassion, empathy and mutual respect.

During the discussion that took place at the public meeting, Mr. Dent advised the Committee that another key change the commission would like to see made to the Human Rights Act involves amending the act to allow the commission to be more proactive in identifying and addressing cases of systemic discrimination.

The committee expressed its general support for changes to the system that would make the process more accessible, particularly for disadvantaged member of the population who may not have the resources to hire legal representation. The committee looks forward to seeing the introduction of a bill in the Legislative Assembly that modernizes and updates the Human Rights Act.

**Recommendation 1**

The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that the Government of the Northwest Territories advise the House of its timeline for the completion and introduction of a bill to modernize and update the Human Rights Act. Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I would now like to hand off to my colleague, Mr. Nakimayak.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Member for Nunakput.

**MR. NAKIMAYAK:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**Financial Summary**

The Office of the Director of the Human Rights Commission and the Human Rights Adjudication panel each has its own operations budget provided through the Legislative Assembly’s appropriation. These items are not included in the Commission’s financial statements and total approximately $1.17 million for the 2014-2015 fiscal year.

The budget for the Human Rights Commission is reviewed and approved by the Legislative Assembly’s Board of Management and provided through an operating grant. The commission’s Statement of General Operations for the year ended March 31, 2015 shows:

In 2014-2015, the total amount of this grant was increased by $100,000 to $350,000 from the previous year;

This additional funding was provided to offset consulting costs associated with the comprehensive review of the Human Rights Act. This appears as expenses for contracts administration for the commission, which totalled $101,790 compared with the previous year’s figure of $5,943 for contracts;

The contribution amount returns to $250,000 in subsequent fiscal years;

In previous years’ reports, the figure for total revenues included the total operating grant less expense reimbursement. This year, the figure for expense reimbursement is not included in the Statement of General Operations;

Total expenses increased by $128,031 which equals 63 per cent;

Notably, legal expenses were down by $56,541 equivalent to 68 per cent; and

Revenue over expenses totalled $19,643, leaving the commission with a surplus again in 2014-2015.

Mr. Speaker, I would like you to hand this back to Mr. Testart.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Member for Kam Lake.

**MR. TESTART:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Thank you colleagues.

In conclusion, the Standing Committee on Government Operations congratulates the Northwest Territories Human Rights Commission on reaching the milestone of its tenth anniversary and for its dedication to outreach, so that all residents of the Northwest Territories from all walks of life understand their human rights and can expect those rights to be respected and upheld.

**Recommendation 2**

The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that the Government of the Northwest Territories provide a response to this report within 120 days.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Member for Kam Lake.

## Motion to receive Committee Report 3-18(2) and move into committee of the Whole, Carried

**MR. TESTART:** Mr. Speaker, that concludes the presentation of our report, therefore, I move, seconded by the honourable Member for Hay River North, that Committee Report 3-18(2), Report of the Standing Committee on Government Operations on the review of the 2014-2015 Northwest Territories Human Rights Commission Annual Report be received by the Assembly and moved into Committee of the Whole for further consideration. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. The motion is on the floor. The motion is in order. To the motion. Question has been called. All those in favour? All those opposed?

---Carried

Committee Report 3-18(2) has been received by the Assembly and is moved into Committee of the Whole for further consideration. Masi, colleagues. Member for Inuvik Twin Lakes.

**HON. ROBERT MCLEOD:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I seek unanimous consent to proceed to item number 6, recognition of visitors in the gallery. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Member seeking unanimous consent to continue discussion on item number 6 of orders of the day.

---Unanimous consent granted

**MR. SPEAKER:** There are no nays. You may continue. Sorry, Member for Inuvik Boot Lake.

# Recognition of Visitors in the Gallery

**HON. ALFRED MOSES:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I have the great opportunity and great honour today to recognize some very special guests in the Great Hall during the Ministers' Culture and Heritage Awards. I'd like to recognize them and thank them for joining us here in the gallery as well as thank them for all the work that they're doing in preserving our cultures, promoting it, and being great ambassadors for the North, for their communities and for their regions as well.

Under the elder award, Mr. Edward Oudzie, I believe he's joining us here today. Accompanying him is Harold Harris from Norman Wells. Winner of the Individual Art was Jessie Campbell and Clarence Campbell was joining her today. Group Award, we have two representatives here from the Open Sky Creative Society, Mr. Lindsay Waugh and Roxanna Thompson from Fort Simpson. Our Youth Award was Marilyn Maring. Accompanying her was Ellen Firth and her eight-month-old daughter Myria, who pretty well stole the show this morning.

Mr. Speaker, I also had the opportunity of having a Ministers' Choice Award, and this year's recipient was the late Sandra Ipana who did 25 years of teaching in Inuvik and the Northwest Territories and promoted her culture very well. Accepting on her behalf was her daughter, Eileen Allen and her son, Mickey Ipana from Inuvik. I'd like to welcome them to the House. As well, I'd like to recognize our ECE staff for doing a great job in coordinating the events. I also believe Mr. Hayden Stewart is joining us from Tuktoyaktuk and he's been a great ambassador in the youth area. So welcome everyone and thanks again for all the work that you do. Mahsi cho, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Recognition of visitors in the gallery. Member for Inuvik Twin Lakes.

**HON. ROBERT MCLEOD:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I too would like to recognize some constituents from Inuvik Twin Lakes. We have Mickey Ipana who I gave a tour of the Assembly for, and we have Eileen Allen who is better known in Inuvik as Bunik. We have Ellen Firth and Marilyn and her daughter, Myria. So welcome to the gallery. We appreciate your patience as we battled through our technical difficulties in the last two hours. Welcome.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Recognition of visitors in the gallery. Member for Yellowknife North.

**MR. VANTHUYNE:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I'd like to take this opportunity to, of course, recognize and congratulate all the Heritage Award winners. I also want to recognize Yellowknife North constituent Barb Cameron who is here with that group and welcome them to the gallery. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Recognition of visitors in the gallery. Member for Sahtu.

**MR. MCNEELY:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I too would like to recognize four members of our Sahtu Region, President Clarence Campbell for the Tulita Land Corporation and his wife Jessie Campbell, the recipient to the Heritage Awards, and Elder Edward Oudzie and businessman Harold Harris. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Recognition of visitors in the gallery. Member for Yellowknife Centre.

**MS. GREEN:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I would like to congratulate all the award winners and I would like to introduce my neighbour and constituent, Karen Wright-Fraser, who helped organize today's events. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Recognition of visitors in the gallery. Member for Nahendeh.

**MR. THOMPSON:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I, too, would like to congratulate the winners of the Heritage Award, and specifically Lindsay Waugh and Roxanna Thompson, who are constituents of mine and very great volunteers in our community, as well as Barb Cameron, who is a former teacher of mine. So, thank you very much, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. I'd just like to remind Members to just wait until the light goes on. I know we get too excited sometimes, but we just have to be patient. Recognition of visitors in the gallery. Member for Nunakput.

**MR. NAKIMAYAK:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I'd like to welcome a couple of pages from Mangilaluk School in Tuktoyaktuk, Carmen Kuptana and Shane Wolki, and as well their chaperone, Mr. Hayden Stewart, who is up in the gallery. Welcome. It's good to have constituents here at the Legislative Assembly. As well, a translator from Inuvik, an Inuvialuit translator, Ms. Lillian Elias, who is sitting in the translation room, and as well as a couple of high school friends I grew up with, Eileen Bunik Allen and Moses Momo Aitana. It's good to have a lot of Inuvialuit here at the Legislative Assembly today. I think we're outnumbering everybody, so thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Recognition of visitors in the gallery. Those individuals we missed in the gallery, welcome to our proceedings. It's always great to have an audience as part of our proceedings. Item 4, reports of standing and special committees. Member for Kam Lake.

# Reports of Standing and Special Committees (Reversion)

## Committee Report 4-18(2): Standing Committee on Government Operations Report on the Review of the 2014-2015 Public Accounts

**MR. TESTART:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Today I am pleased to present Committee Report 4-18(2), Standing Committee on Government Operations Report on the Review of the 2014-2015 Public Accounts.

**Executive Summary**

The Standing Committee on Government Operations is pleased to present its first report during the term of the 18th Legislative Assembly, on the review of the public accounts. The review, which included an orientation to the public accounts provided by staff of the Office of the Auditor General, took place in Yellowknife, Northwest Territories, from April 12-14, 2016. The Committee notes that the consolidated 2014-2015 Public Accounts of the Government of the Northwest Territories received a clean audit opinion from the Auditor General and commends the Government of the Northwest Territories for this achievement.

Members of the Standing Committee would like to take the opportunity to thank officials from the Office of the Auditor General who traveled from Ottawa and Edmonton to provide the Standing Committee with their expert advice, which included an introduction to the public accounts and the role of the Office of the Auditor General. The Standing Committee also wishes to thank officials from the Office of the Comptroller General in the GNWT’s Department of Finance for their appearance before the Standing Committee.

**2014-2015 Recommendations**

As a result of this year’s review of the 2014-2015 Public Accounts, the Standing Committee on Government Operations makes the following recommendations to the Government of the Northwest Territories:

1. The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that the Minister of Finance provide the committee with the interim public accounts by August 31st, in time for committee review of the government’s business plans.
2. The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that the Office of the Comptroller General in the Department of Finance continue to work with the Auditor General of Canada and GNWT departments, boards, and agencies to complete the interim and final public accounts at the earliest possible date each year,and in time for their respective statutory reporting deadlines, and to seek the necessary extensions where those deadlines cannot be met.
3. The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that the Office of the Comptroller General include in the consolidated public accounts a list of all departments, boards and agencies in the government reporting entity, their deadlines for the completion of financial statements, and whether or not those deadlines were met.
4. The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that the Government of the Northwest Territories continue to provide updated timetables or schedules for the environmental assessment of all known potentially contaminated sites for which the GNWT is responsible, to be included annually in the public accounts.
5. The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that, in addition to reporting, on a consolidated basis, on the performance measures specified in the Fiscal Responsibility Policy, the Government of the Northwest Territories report, on a non-consolidated basis, on the performance measures related to the policy provisions on Infrastructure Financing and Affordable debt.
6. The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that the Minister of Finance work with the Minister responsible for Public Engagement and Transparency to develop plain language materials that report on the public accounts in a manner that is understandable for an interested, non-professional reader.
7. The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that the Department of Finance amend the Non-consolidated Schedule of Bad Debt Write-offs, Forgiveness and Student Loan Remissions to protect the privacy of individuals by removing the names of those who have received student loan remissions and reporting only the amount of the remissions.
8. The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that the Government of the Northwest Territories provide a response to this report within 120 days.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Member for Kam Lake.

## Motion that Committee Report 4-18(2) Be deemed read and Printed in Hansard in its Entirety, Carried

**MR. TESTART:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I move, seconded by the honourable Member for Hay River North, that Committee Report 4-18(2) be deemed read and printed in Hansard in its entirety. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. There is a motion on the floor. The motion is in order. To the motion.

---Carried

Committee Report 4-18(2) will be deemed read and will be printed in Hansard in its entirety. Masi, colleagues.

**Introduction**

The Legislative Assembly of the Northwest Territories’ Standing Committee on Government Operations (SCOGO or the Committee) has a mandate to review and report on the Government of the Northwest Territories’ public accounts. This review helps ensure that the GNWT’s fiscal management practices and issues are publicly examined and scrutinized to promote government accountability.

In the course of its review, the committee makes recommendations to the government to improve financial management reporting and practices. The Standing Committee on Government Operations is pleased to present this report on its review and looks forward to receiving the government’s response.

**About the Public Accounts Generally**

The public accounts are the financial statements of the Government of the Northwest Territories (GNWT), which are prepared according to public sector accounting standards adopted across Canada.

The public accounts of the GNWT are also prepared in accordance with requirements contained in the federal Northwest Territories Act (S.C. 2014, c. 2, s. 2) and the GNWT’s Financial Administration Act (FAA). The FAA requires that the public accounts be prepared in two phases: first, the unaudited interim (non-consolidated) public accounts and later, the final (consolidated) public accounts, which are audited.

The public accounts disclose the GNWT’s financial position and results of operations as at March 31st of a given fiscal year. The GNWT’s financial position is revealed through information on assets, liabilities, net debt and accumulated surplus. This information assists the reader in evaluating the GNWT’s ability to finance its activities, to meet its liabilities and contractual obligations, and to provide future services.

The results of operations show the revenues and expenses of the GNWT for the fiscal year. This allows the GNWT to account for the resources it received and to demonstrate how those resources were budgeted for and expended.

The consolidated public accounts are produced in four sections:

* Section I contains the consolidated financial statements and combined results of operations for all GNWT departments, revolving funds, public agencies, territorial corporations and other related entities that are considered part of the government reporting entity. This section provides a high-level, aggregated (combined) look at the financial position of the Government and its various departments and agencies, so that the reader is able to gauge the overall financial health of the Government, as opposed to the stand-alone position of any single department or agency. It discloses the full nature and extent of the financial affairs and resources for which the GNWT is responsible.
* In Section I, the notes to the consolidated financial statements are an integral part of the public accounts and should be read in conjunction with the financial statements. This section also contains an unaudited Financial Statement Discussion and Analysis by the Minister of Finance, which provides further insight from the GNWT’s perspective into the information reported in the public accounts.
* Section II presents the non-consolidated, unaudited financial statements for GNWT departments, the Legislative Assembly, and Statutory Offices. Section II is comprised of the financial position and results of operations for GNWT departments only, including the revolving funds and special purpose funds they administer. Providing this information separately allows the reader to assess the collective financial position of the GNWT’s departments, as separate and distinct from that of its larger operations which includes public boards, agencies and territorial corporations. This section also includes important notes to the financial statements.
* Section III contains the supplementary financial statements of other entities and revolving and special purpose funds.
* Section IV contains the supplementary financial statements of education boards and health and social services authorities.

It should be noted that the public accounts are based on historical information. They are, therefore, backwards looking and pertain to actual spending for the given fiscal year in question.

**Role of the Auditor**

With respect to the examination of the public accounts, the federal Northwest Territories Act conveys to the Auditor General all powers contained in the Auditor General Act (R.S.C., 1985, c. A-17). The Auditor General of Canada audits the GNWT’s consolidated financial statements on an annual basis. The Auditor General also annually audits the public accounts of some the GNWT’s larger public agencies, such the Northwest Territories Hydro Corporation, the Northwest Territories Power Corporation, the Northwest Territories Housing Corporation, Aurora College and the Northwest Territories Business Development and Investment Corporation.

Smaller public agencies, such as regional health authorities and education boards, are audited by independent Certified Public Accountants, upon whose work the Office of the Auditor General (OAG) relies in carrying out its audit of the GNWT’s consolidated financial statements. The OAG reviews the audits of these smaller entities on a rotational basis (i.e. once every three years).

Regardless of who prepares it, the purpose of an audit remains the same. As specified in legislation, the purpose of an audit is twofold:

1. To allow the auditor to express an expert opinion as to whether the financial statements present the financial position of the government body fairly, in all material respects. This includes the financial position of the government body, the results of its operations, changes in its net debt and its cash flows for the fiscal year being examined.
2. To examine financial transactions to ensure they have been carried out in accordance with the powers provided to the government body under law.

It is important to note that the audit of the public accounts is a financial audit, as opposed to a performance audit. Although a financial audit and a performance audit share procedural similarities, they are not the same.

A performance audit focuses on efficiency measurements by identifying operational problems related to management, and resourcing and identifying their causes. In this sense, a performance audit is focused primarily on people and on the quality of performance of a government department, board or agency as defined in its legislative and policy mandate.

A financial audit focuses on the accuracy and correctness of financial accounts. It does not explore the quality of management decisions. In a financial audit, the attention is directed towards finances and on determining if a government’s figures have been recorded as required by national standards.

In conducting a financial audit, the auditor undertakes a risk-based audit approach that focuses on significant risks of material misstatement and non-compliance with significant authorities. Materiality is an important concept in auditing, related to the importance or significance of an amount, transaction or discrepancy. Based on professional judgment, the auditor determines what errors are considered material in the public accounts.

For each department, board or agency whose books are audited, the independent auditor prepares an audit report that addresses each of the audit objectives. These reports are included in the public accounts along with the financial statements for each entity.

**The Significance of a Clean Audit Opinion**

In an unqualified or clean report, the auditor concludes that the government’s financial statements present its financial affairs fairly in all material respects. This indicates that the government observed compliance with Canadian public sector accounting standards and statutory requirements. This also demonstrates that any changes in the accounting policies, and the impact of these changes, have been adequately determined and revealed.

It is important to note that a clean opinion does not tell the reader that the government is in good economic health. It merely states that its financial report is complete and transparent and has not misstated any important facts.

**Review of the GNWT Public Accounts for 2014-2015**

**Introduction**

This is the first review of the public accounts by the Standing Committee on Government Operations of the 18th Legislative Assembly. The review, which included an orientation to the public accounts provided by staff of the Office of the Auditor General, took place in Yellowknife, Northwest Territories, from April 12-14, 2016.

The committee notes that the consolidated 2014-2015 Public Accounts of the GNWT received a clean audit opinion from the Auditor General and commends the Government of the Northwest Territories for this achievement.

**Acknowledgements**

Members of the Standing Committee would like to take the opportunity to thank the following officials from the Office of the Auditor General for their willing assistance and candid insight, which provided the Committee with a solid introduction to the purpose, structure and function of the public accounts:

* Mr. Terry DeJong, Assistant Auditor General (Ottawa)
* Mr. Jerome Berthelette, Assistant Auditor General (Ottawa)
* Mr. Glenn Wheeler, Principal (Ottawa)
* Mr. Guy LeGras, Principal (Edmonton)
* Ms. Erin Jellinek, Auditor (Ottawa)
* Ms. Michelle Smith, Director (Edmonton)
* Ms. Maria Pooley, Auditor (Ottawa)

In addition, the Standing Committee wishes to thank the following officials from the Office of the Comptroller General in the GNWT’s Department of Finance (Yellowknife) for their appearance before the Standing Committee on April 14, 2016:

* Mr. Bill Merklinger, Comptroller General (retiring)
* Mr. Jamie Koe, Comptroller General
* Ms. Louise Lavoie, Assistant Comptroller General

**Timeliness of the Public Accounts**

The Financial Administration Act (FAA) governs the preparation of the public accounts. A new and modernized version of the FAA (S.N.W.T. 2015, c.13) came into force on April 1, 2016, and will govern the preparation of the public accounts from 2015-2016 forward.

For the purpose of this review, however, the 2014-2015 public accounts were prepared under the old Financial Administration Act (R.S.N.W.T 1988, c. F-4). Under this version of the act, Section 51 requires that the interim public accounts be completed by September 30 after the end of the fiscal year and tabled in the Legislative Assembly at the first opportunity. With respect to the consolidated public accounts, Section 74 requires that, “unless the Legislative Assembly otherwise fixes a date, the public accounts for the fiscal year must be tabled on or before December 31st following the end of the fiscal year or, if the Legislative Assembly is not then in Session, not later than 15 days after the commencement of the next Session of the Legislative Assembly.”

During the 17th Legislative Assembly, the Standing Committee on Government Operations paid close attention to the completion times for the public accounts. Mindful of this, the current committee notes that the 2014-2015 Interim Public Accounts were signed off by the Minister of Finance and transmitted to the standing committee on August 31, 2015, which is in keeping with the commitment made by the Minister of Finance during the review of the 2013-2014 Public Accounts. As per legislative requirement, this report was tabled in the Legislative Assembly at the first opportunity, on October 8, 2015.

The consolidated 2014-2015 Public Accounts were signed by the Minister on November 18, 2015, a full month later than in 2013-2014. The Department of Finance explained that this delay was the direct result of changes in the way that the Northwest Territories Hydro Corporation is accounted for in the public accounts. The impact of this change, effective for the 2014-2015 fiscal year, is discussed later in this report. The Committee is satisfied that the delay faced by Northwest Territories Hydro Corporation was warranted under the circumstances and does not expect to see it repeated in future years.

The consolidated 2014-15 public accounts were tabled at the first opportunity on February 22, 2016. This is four months later than the previous year, but was unavoidable due to the timing of the 2015 Territorial Election.

The committee reviewed the deadlines for the individual departments, boards and agencies in the government reporting entity. The committee notes that Northwest Territories Hydro Corporation requested and received an extension to its deadline, as permitted in the FAA, but missed its extended deadline by more than two months. Aurora College requested an extension to its deadline, but missed its extended deadline by just over two weeks. While recognizing the capacity challenges facing smaller agencies, the Committee also notes that the Tlicho Community Services Agency missed its deadline by three weeks and did not seek an extension.

Finally, the Committee noted the improvement made by the Northwest Territories Housing Corporation in completing its financial statements in a timely manner. The Housing Corporation has had past difficulties with timeliness, again owing in part to capacity issues faced by Local Housing Organizations in completing their record keeping. For 2014-2015, the NWT Housing Corporation sought an extension of their June 30th deadline to August 31st. Their consolidated financial statements were completed on August 19th, a month earlier than the previous fiscal year.

The standing committee makes the following recommendations with respect to timeliness of the public accounts:

**Recommendation 1**

The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that the Minister of Finance provide the committee with the interim public accounts by August 31st, in time for committee review of the government’s business plans.

**Recommendation 2**

The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that the Office of the Comptroller General in the Department of Finance work with the Auditor General of Canada and GNWT departments, boards, and agencies to complete the interim and final public accounts at the earliest possible date each year, and in time to meet statutory reporting deadlines, and to seek the necessary extensions where those deadlines cannot be met.

**Recommendation 3**

The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that the Office of the Comptroller General include in the consolidated public accounts a list of all departments, boards and agencies in the government reporting entity, their deadlines for the completion of financial statements, and whether or not those deadlines were met.

**Consolidation of the Northwest Territories Hydro Corporation**

During the previous year’s review of the public accounts (2013-2014), the Office of the Auditor General advised the 17th Assembly’s Standing Committee on Government Operations that the treatment of the Northwest Territories Hydro Corporation (NT Hydro) and its subsidiary Northwest Territories Power Corporation (NTPC) in the public accounts would be changing effective April 1, 2014.

This change was precipitated by the reclassification of NT Hydro from a “government business enterprise” to an “other government organization” under Canadian public sector accounting standards (PSAS).

According to the Chartered Professional Accountants of Canada’s CPA Public Sector Handbook, a government business enterprise is an organization that has all of the following characteristics:

1. It is a separate legal entity with the power to contract in its own name and to sue or be sued;
2. It has been delegated the financial and operational authority to carry on as a business;
3. It sells goods and services to individuals and organizations outside of the government reporting entity as its principal activity; and
4. It can, in the normal course of its operations, maintain its operations and meet its liabilities from revenues received from sources outside of the government reporting entity.

In recent years, the Northwest Territories Power Corporation has experienced difficulty maintaining its operations and meeting its liabilities through revenues generated by ratepayers. As a result, it has received substantial subsidies from the GNWT to offset rate increases.

In recognition of NTPC’s changing economic circumstances, its likely need for on-going additional financial support, and the fact that it no longer meets all of the requirements for a government business enterprise, the Office of the Auditor General directed that NTPC be reclassified. This, in turn, prompted the decision that NTPC adopt and adhere to public sector accounting standards.

As a government business enterprise, NTPC’s books of account were historically prepared using the modified equity method and consolidated in the GNWT’s public accounts on a summary basis. As a result of its reclassification as an “other government organization”, NTPC’s books of account for 2014-2015 were prepared according to public sector accounting standards and consolidated in the GNWT’s public accounts on a line-by-line basis. This will continue to be the case in future years, provided that NTPC’s circumstances remain unchanged.

In addition to causing a delay in completion of the public accounts, the transition to PSAS resulted in changes to the manner by which a number of significant balances on the NT Hydro and NTPC financial statements were measured and recorded. Impacts resulting from this change in the basis of accounting include:

* an increase of approximately $4.1 million to the GNWT’s opening accumulated surplus as at April 1, 2014;
* an increase in net debt in the amount of $343,864, to bring the total adjusted net debt at the beginning of the year to $707,744;
* an increase in the cash opening balance of $1.157 million to $64 million;
* as at March 31, 2015, an increase in accounts payable of $92 million over the previous year, of which $12 million is attributable to the consolidation of NT Hydro payables;
* as at March 31, 2015, an increase in short-term debt of $108 million over the previous year, of which $18 million is attributable to the consolidation of NT Hydro; and
* as at March 31, 2015, an $11.5 million increase in the total cost of the GNWT’s environmental liabilities to $61.8 million.

This accounting change also includes the elimination of regulatory deferral accounts which are not permitted under PSAS but which could be used under the old system of rate-regulated accounting to smooth out rate spikes by deferring certain expenses to future years. This will result in increased volatility in NTPC’s future annual operating results.

It should be noted that the decision to reclassify NT Hydro as an “other government organization” does not affect the way in which NT Hydro is managed; it relates only to the manner in which NT Hydro’s books of account are handled for accounting purposes. At the writing of this report, NT Hydro continues to operate as a territorial corporation under the authority of the Northwest Territories Hydro Corporation Act.

It should also be noted that the consolidation of NT Hydro in the GNWT’s public accounts has no impact on the GNWT’s borrowing limit, as NT Hydro debt has always counted against the borrowing limit. At March 31, 2015, NT Hydro’s long-term debt remained unchanged from the previous year at $177 million, while operational debt was down $2 million to $18 million.

The GNWT’s authority to incur debt is authorized by the Government of Canada pursuant to subsection 20(2) of the federal Northwest Territories Act. At March 31, 2015, the GNWT’s authorized borrowing limit was set at $800 million.

**Environmental Liabilities**

A new accounting standard (PS 3260), governing the accounting treatment of environmental liabilities, was developed by the Public Sector Accounting Board and came into effect for the 2014-2015 fiscal year. Under this new standard, the GNWT is responsible for recording estimates in its financial statements for the further evaluation or remediation of all known contaminated sites for which the government is legally responsible or for which it has accepted responsibility.

Environmental liabilities arise when contamination exceeds established environmental standards. The estimated costs for the management and remediation of contaminated sites should reflect the government’s best estimate of the funds required to remediate the site to the current minimum standard and should include costs associated with: site assessments; remedial action plans; remediation activities; and post-closing of the site. Estimated remediation costs are recorded in the year in which they become known.

Uncertainty about the existence of contamination or the extent of remediation costs does not alleviate the Government of its responsibility to record the liability. When estimates are not readily available, the Government may estimate based on known costs for the remediation of sites of a similar size and level of contamination. If the likelihood of the GNWT’s obligation to remediate the site cannot be determined, or if the amount of the liability cannot be reasonably estimated, then this contingency is disclosed in the notes to the consolidated financial statements.

The adoption of this new accounting standard by the GNWT has resulted in greater disclosure of environmental liabilities under note 12 to the consolidated financial statements. The Standing Committee reviewed the contaminated sites for which the GNWT is responsible. The following information about environmental liabilities is reported in the key notes:

* The GNWT has identified 216 sites potentially requiring environmental remediation as at March 31, 2015. [2014 – 129].
* Total remediation costs for these sites are estimated at $68.9 million [$61.8 total remediation costs + $7.1 million for NT Hydro asset retirement obligations]. This is an increase of $32.1 million over the previous year.
* Giant Mine has been formally designated as contaminated under the Environmental Protection Act (NWT). The balance of the GNWT’s share of the above-ground remediation is $2.994 million [2014 - $3.052 million].
* There are six other abandoned non-operating mine sites that the Government will be remediating in conjunction with the Government of Canada. Cost estimates for the remediation of these sites are in the same order of magnitude as the GNWT’s share of the remediation costs for Giant Mine.
* There are 28 sewage lagoons and 41 landfill sites outside of incorporated communities. These are being remediated or monitored as appropriate.
* Included in the 216 sites are 71 sites for which no liability has been recognized. Monitoring of these sites is on-going under the GNWT’s environmental protection program.

The committee acknowledges the receipt of information on the status of sites with known or potential contamination for which the GNWT is responsible and appreciates the opportunity to review this information during the annual review of the public accounts. The Committee asks that Members continue to be provided with updated information at regular intervals.

**Recommendation 4**

The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that the Government of the Northwest Territories continue to provide updated timetables or schedules for the environmental assessment of all known potentially contaminated sites for which the GNWT is responsible, to be included annually in the public accounts.

**Fiscal Responsibility Policy**

The Government of the Northwest Territories established its Fiscal Responsibility Policy in 2005. It is intended to promote on-going fiscal sustainability by guiding prudent borrowing and ensuring that government debt remains affordable.

The Fiscal Responsibility Policy establishes specific numerical limits, expressed as percentages, restricting infrastructure financing and debt servicing as follows:

1. Infrastructure Financing

The government will restrict infrastructure investments, excluding Public-Private Partnership projects as follows:

1. A minimum of fifty per cent from the operating surpluses generated within the non-consolidated Public Accounts (emphasis added);
2. A maximum of fifty per cent from government debt.
3. Affordable debt(includes debt associated with public-private partnership projects)
4. Non-consolidated debt servicing payments shall not exceed five per cent of total non-consolidated annual revenues; and
5. Where non-consolidated debt servicing payments exceed five per cent of total non-consolidated annual revenues, operating surpluses shall be generated in the following two years sufficient to permit principal repayments that will decrease debt servicing payments to five per cent by the third subsequent year.

In Section 7, the Fiscal Responsibility Policy does identify performance measures against which government investment and borrowing will be assessed and upon which the GNWT has made a commitment to report, however, these measures are not sufficient to provide a full accounting of the government’s performance in respect of the policy.

The performance measures identified in the policy are: debt to revenue ratio; debt per capita ratio; debt servicing costs as a per cent of revenue; debt servicing payments as a per cent of revenue; debt servicing payments as a per cent of three-year moving GDP average; net debt per capita ratio; and credit rating.

This section of the policy specifies that “all measures are to be assessed on a consolidated basis for the Government Reporting Entity” (emphasis added). While the committee acknowledges the utility of such information, the provisions of the policy related to infrastructure financing and affordable debt are not based on the consolidated public accounts, but rather on the non-consolidated public accounts.

In order for the public to adequately assess whether or not the GNWT has met these particular provisions of the Fiscal Responsibility Policy, it is the view of the Standing Committee that the GNWT should be reporting specifically on relevant data related to these quantifiable provisions, which are measurable under the non-consolidated public accounts. This will allow the average reader of the public accounts to determine whether or not the GNWT has met or exceeded the specific percentage threshold limits relating to infrastructure financing and affordable debt, as set out in the policy.

**Recommendation 5**

The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that, in addition to reporting, on a consolidated basis, on the performance measures specified in the Fiscal Responsibility Policy, the Government of the Northwest Territories report, on a non-consolidated basis, on the performance measures related to the policy provisions on Infrastructure Financing and Affordable debt.

**Accountability and Transparency**

A commitment to improving accountability and transparency is one of the key priorities of the 18th Legislative Assembly, and a fundamental building block in the Mandate of the Government of the Northwest Territories. In order to meaningfully report to the residents of the Northwest Territories on the work that the GNWT carries out on behalf of the residents of the Northwest Territories, information provided to the public must be clear, concise, and easily understood by the average reader who is not a specialist in the subject matter.

The public accounts form the definitive source of information for the public on the GNWT’s fiscal performance. However, these documents are, by their very nature, dense in content and difficult for non-experts to understand. As noted at the outset of this report, the public accounts are prepared in accordance with federal and territorial legislation and following standards set by the Public Sector Accounting Board. These requirements obligate the GNWT to prepare and present the public accounts in a format that does not easily lend itself to comprehension by non-expert readers.

Nonetheless, the standing committee notes the importance of making the information contained in the public accounts as clear as possible for interested readers lacking expertise in finance or accounting. In the committee’s view, a commitment to accountability and transparency is synonymous with a commitment to improve the quality of reporting, especially for a non-expert audience. It is, therefore, incumbent upon the government to make the important information contained in the public accounts digestible for consumption by members of the public.

The committee notes, with interest, that this point of view is shared by the C.D. Howe Institute which has again, this year, produced a study examining the quality of financial reporting by the federal and provincial and territorial governments in Canada. The C.D. Howe report attempts to assess “whether an intelligent and motivated non-expert – a citizen, taxpayer, or legislator – could find valid consolidated numbers for revenue and spending in the budget each government presents at the beginning of the year and in the financial statements released with its public accounts at the end of the year.” While the standing committee neither endorses nor opposes the C.D. Howe study, committee members do note that the GNWT received a failing grade E this year because non-expert readers “would likely struggle to find and compare PSAB-consistent figures, or would not be able to find them at all.”

The committee encourages the government to review the C.D. Howe study and to consider ways to improve on its quality of reporting in the public accounts and to augment the public accounts with explanatory materials that assist the public in finding the information necessary to understand and assess the government’s fiscal performance.

**Recommendation 6**

The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that the Minister of Finance work with the Minister responsible for Public Engagement and Transparency to develop plain language materials that report on the public accounts in a manner that is understandable for an interested, non-professional reader.

**Protection of Privacy and Disclosure of Information**

The Standing Committee recognizes that government must strike a balance between protecting the privacy of individuals’ personal information and disclosing information that is in the public interest.

During the review, the Standing Committee discussed with officials from the Office of the Comptroller General the level of disclosure in the public accounts related to the remediation of contaminated sites. It is the view of the Standing Committee that the Government should be providing greater disclosure of this information. The committee accepts the explanation provided by officials that the level of detail committee members wish to see may not be appropriate for the public accounts, but could be provided on the GNWT’s website.

The Non-consolidated Public Accounts’ Non-consolidated Schedule of Bad Debt Write-offs, Forgiveness and Student Loan Remissions identifies, by name, all individuals who have received a remission on their student loans and the amount of that remission. It is the view of the committee that the degree of disclosure related to this information may constitute a breach of privacy of those individuals named in the schedule. Accordingly, the committee makes the following recommendation:

**Recommendation 7**

The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that the Department of Finance consider amending the Non-consolidated Schedule of Bad Debt Write-offs, Forgiveness and Student Loan Remissions by removing the names of those who have received student loan remissions and reporting only the amount of the remissions.

**Conclusion**

The Standing Committee on Government Operations has a mandate to review the public accounts of the Government of the Northwest Territories so that GNWT financial management practices and decisions receive public scrutiny. Committee members were grateful for the assistance provided by the Office of the Auditor General in support of this work. Committee members also appreciate the appearances before the Standing Committee by staff from the Office of the Comptroller General in the Department of Finance. The Standing Committee looks forward to the Government’s response to this report.

**Recommendation 8**

The Standing Committee on Government Operations recommends that the Government of the Northwest Territories provide a response to this report within 120 days.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Member for Kam Lake.

## Motion to Receive Committee Report 4-18(2) and move into committee of the whole, Carried

**MR. TESTART:** Mr. Speaker, I move, seconded by the honourable Member for Hay River North, that Committee Report 4-18(2) Standing Committee on Government Operations Report on the Review of the 2014-2015 Public Accounts be received by the Assembly and moved into Committee of the Whole for further consideration. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Motion is on the floor. Motion is in order. To the motion.

---Carried

Report 4-18(2) has been received by the Assembly and is now moving to Committee of the Whole for further consideration. Masi, colleagues. Reports of standing and special committees. Member for Frame Lake.

## Committee Report 5-18(2): Standing Committee on Rules and Procedures Interim Report on the Review of Standing Committee Public Engagement and Transparency

**MR. O'REILLY:** Merci, Monsieur le President. It is my pleasure to present Committee Report 5-18(2), Standing Committee on Rules and Procedures Interim Report on the Review of Standing Committee Public Engagement and Transparency.

**Introduction**

By Motion 10-18(2), the Standing Committee on Rules and Procedures was tasked on February 25, 2016 with recommending a process for standing committee public engagement and transparency. This motion reads: whereas the Standing Committee on Priorities and Planning has expressed its support for greater public participation in the democratic process, thereby increasing opportunities for public engagement with respect to the work of the standing committees established under the Rules of the Legislative Assembly; and whereas this government has also recognized the importance of accessibility and transparency and has named a Minister Responsible for Public Engagement and Transparency; and whereas it would be beneficial for this Assembly to have a process established to guide its committees as they work to increase public engagement, becoming more accessible and transparent; and whereas the Standing Committee recognizes the process conventions currently established and adopted by this Assembly to assist all Members, within their respective roles, to work for the collective good of the people of the Northwest Territories;

Now therefore I move, seconded by the honourable Member for Thebacha, that this Assembly refers the issue of standing committee public engagement and transparency to the Standing Committee on Rules and Procedures to recommend a process that may be adopted by all standing committees of the 18th Assembly; and further, that the research and analysis include consultation with the public and a jurisdictional review; and furthermore, that the Standing Committee on Rules and Procedures report back to the House with its recommendations during the fall 2016 sitting.

This review supports the Assembly’s desire for greater public participation in the democratic process, with increased transparency and opportunities for public engagement by standing committees. This is particularly important in the Northwest Territories where standing committees play a critical role in our unique consensus system of governance.

This interim report explores core principles for public engagement and identifies immediate actions to increase public knowledge of standing committees, their role, and the work they do. It also identifies areas which require further consideration and consultation. Mr. Speaker, I'd like to pass this on to the Member for Yellowknife Centre.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Member for Yellowknife Centre.

**MS. GREEN:** Mahsi, Mr. Speaker.

**Background**

Many legislatures across the globe face a common problem: Their citizens are neither knowledgeable about, nor very satisfied with them as institutions. This political disengagement, coupled with generational change, increased policy and legislative complexity, declining scrutiny by traditional media, and the growing influence of social media have all contributed to the sense of a growing democratic deficit between the public and the lawmakers.

In an effort to bridge this democratic deficit, there has been a worldwide shift towards open government. Public engagement strategies have been developed by many legislatures. The broadly held view is that improved levels of knowledge about a legislature will contribute to greater public understanding of it, which, in turn, will increase accountability, satisfaction, and public participation.

Members of the 18th Assembly recognize the need for greater transparency and accountability in our consensus government. They are committed to providing the public with more information about the decision-making process and better opportunities to take part. To this end, Members of the Legislative Assembly recently revised the Guiding Principles and Process Conventions for Consensus Government to move toward open government [see Tabled Document 207-18(2)].

**Designing Effective Public Engagement**

The extent to which the public could participate in governmental processes and decision-making has been described as a spectrum by organizations such as the International Association for Public Participation (IAP2). At one end of the spectrum is the one-way flow of information intended to inform and educate the public. At the other end of the spectrum is the delegation of decision-making, empowering members of the public to make the decisions. Between these two extremes are “consultation” and “collaboration”.

One of the greatest challenges is to create the right conditions for effective community and public engagement. Channels for involving interest groups and specialized experts in public decision-making are well established in most governments. Channels for broader input from citizens who wish to participate in setting public policy are less defined. Authentic public engagement enables regular citizens to deliberate and collaborate on complex public problems. As a result, leaders know where the public stands, while citizens themselves contribute to solutions through their input, ideas and actions.

The small and diverse population of the Northwest Territories is sometimes an advantage. There are many examples of high-quality, productive public input in the history of the Legislative Assembly, including committee hearings on legislation that have profoundly improved the bills that were ultimately enacted. In recent years, these include hearings on the Mental Health Act, the Northern Employee Benefits Services Pension Plan Act, the Child and Family Services Act*,* and others. These are useful examples on which to build on.

The ultimate goal is to promote a “culture of openness” in which citizens provide input, monitor progress, and see that their participation is valued by decision-makers. According to the Center for Advances in Public Engagement, a non-profit and nonpartisan organization based in the United States, authentic and skilled engagement with a broad cross-section of stakeholders improves results by:

* bringing together multiple points of view to inform decisions;
* creating legitimacy and a sense of shared responsibility by involving the public early and often before decisions are made;
* fostering new allies and collaborations;
* stimulating broad awareness and momentum for change

Public engagement initiatives should be well-planned and meaningful. As noted in an October, 2009 article by Cary Coglianese, in Governance: An International Journal of Policy, Administration and Institutions, more transparency and engagement does not necessarily lead to better decision-making. Care must be taken not to:

* stifle honest and frank discussion of issues among the decision-makers;
* increase information sharing and engagement with a narrow group of already engaged individuals, organizations, or special interest groups; or
* limit the type of information brought forward, for fear it will breach a privilege, impact on-going negotiations, or have a negative impact on other matters

Public engagement initiatives should not raise an unreasonable expectation that all information will be available to the public or that public input will be sought on all issues. Governments have often failed to manage expectations of public consultation. The U.S.-based National Coalition for Dialogue and Deliberation (NCDD) led a collaborative project which identified seven core principles for public engagement. These principles were outlined in 2009, in Core Principles for Public Engagement:

1. Careful planning and preparation: Through adequate and inclusive planning, ensure that the design, organization, and convening of the process serve both a clearly-defined purposed and the needs of the participants;
2. Inclusion and demographic diversity: Equitably incorporate diverse people, voices, ideas, and information to lay the groundwork for quality outcomes and democratic legitimacy;
3. Collaboration and shared purpose: Support and encourage participants, government and community institutions, and others to work together for the common good;
4. Openness and learning: Help all those involved listen to each other, explore new ideas unconstrained by predetermined outcomes, learn and apply information in ways that generate new options, and rigorously evaluate public engagement activities for effectiveness;
5. Transparency and trust: Be clear and open about the process, and provide a public record of the organizers, sponsors, outcomes, and range of views and ideas expressed;
6. Impact and action: Ensure each participatory effort had real potential to make a difference, and that participants are aware of that potential;
7. Sustained engagement and participatory culture: Promote a culture of participation with programs and institutions that support on-going, quality public engagement.

The committee believes these core principles are applicable to the task of increasing standing committee transparency and public engagement. We applied them to our consideration of the options for immediate action, and will be mindful of them in our on-going work.

In addition, plain language should be used to ensure that information and invitations to participate are appropriate to the intended audience. This may involve the use of plain language experts where appropriate. Members of the public may reasonably expect to be capable of navigating information provided through engagement initiatives. Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I'd like to now call on Mr. Beaulieu to continue with the report.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Member for Tu Nedhe-Wiilideh.

**MR. BEAULIEU:** Marci Cho, Mr. Speaker.

**Current Engagement Activities**

Information about on-going business of the Legislative Assembly and its committees is available on the Legislative Assembly’s website. It currently includes a brief description of the purpose and role of committees in our consensus system of government. A list of committees and their memberships is posted, as well as each committee’s terms of reference. Links to committee reports are also provided.

The Legislative Assembly and its committees regularly use a variety of tools to engage the public and disseminate information including social media, our in-house television broadcasting system, and radio rebroadcasts of session proceedings. Town halls, public meetings, and requests for comments from members of the public have been limited to specific reports and legislative initiatives, yet provide a foundation on which to build.

**Observations from Other Jurisdictions**

The committee compared our Assembly’s public information and engagement practices with those of legislatures in Canada, the Commonwealth, and municipal governments. For the purposes of this cross-jurisdictional scan, public engagement is defined as a range of activities whose primary function is both to raise public awareness of the legislature and facilitate a two-way flow of information, ideas and views, requiring both listening and interaction on the part of both the institution and the citizen.

Other governments, public engagement programs, and expected results vary widely. Some jurisdictions focus on informing and educating the public while others go further, seeking consultation and collaboration. The committee seeks to develop procedures to best suit the Northwest Territories and have taken the following current and potential practices under consideration.

* Information provision: Educational and training materials, website presence;
* Public access: Visitor services, tours, exhibits;
* Education: On-site/off-site activities and resources for teachers, students, and the general public;
* Outreach: Informational workshops, (such as Ledge Talks, the Mace Tour, Caucus retreats, public hearings, town halls, and Legislative Assembly Television-LATV);
* Facilitation: Platforms to engage the public, including online forums;
* Media: Promotional and partnership initiatives with print, broadcasting and social media platforms;
* Institutional structure: Leadership, resourcing, and models for delivering public engagement strategies.

The internet has become a primary means of communicating with the public; committee websites and online content are well-established in most parliamentary jurisdictions. The committee also recognizes that connectivity remains an issue in some NWT communities, as is proficiency with the internet among elders.

As the committee continues to develop options for our standing committees, lessons on emerging best practices have been drawn from diverse jurisdictions, including Scotland, Wales, the Canadian House of Commons, and the City of Yellowknife. Mr. Speaker. I would now like to hand off the reading to the Member from Nahendeh. Marci cho.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Member for Nahendeh.

**MR. THOMPSON:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker

**Public Transparency and Engagement in the Work of the 18th Assembly**

Because a key role of standing committees’ is to hold government accountable, much of the committees’ work is driven by action (or lack of action) by the government. Members note that the Mandate of the Government of the Northwest Territories, 2016-2019 includes pledges to:

* maximize citizens’ ability to access government by using consistent approaches to social media, visual identity, and overall communications;
* establish an Open Government Policy to enhance civic participation, increase the availability and accessibility of information about government activities, and explore new technologies for openness and accountability; and,
* improve opportunities for meaningful public input into government decision-making by improving access to government public engagement initiatives and reporting on how public views have shaped government decisions.

Improved transparency and engagement by standing committees is a necessary follow-up to effective work in these areas by the government.

The committee suggests that standing committees focus first on informing and educating the public, which should result in increased accountability and opportunity for consultation. The key objectives of this approach are to provide useful information to support public understanding and to obtain feedback on analysis, alternatives and/or decisions. A stepped approach should be taken based on results from previous measures and proven successes. Tools that can be utilized to educate and engage include the following:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| * Open Houses * Fact Sheets * Bulletins * Websites * Meeting Schedules and Calendar * Public Comment * Focus Groups * Surveys * Public Meetings |  |

The promise made in using such tools is that standing committees will keep the public informed, listen to and acknowledge concerns and aspirations, and provide feedback on how public input influenced decisions. By doing so, our hope is to generate further engagement and discussion. Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I'd like to hand this off to the honourable Member for Thebacha. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Member for Thebacha.

**MR. SEBERT:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**Improving Standing Committee Transparency and Public Engagement**

Members of this Committee feel that standing committees should strive to operate in a transparent manner consistent with the seven core principles for public engagement described above, and the Guiding Principles and Process Conventions for consensus government adopted by the Members of the 18th Assembly. The recent adoption of these Principles and Conventions has had an impact on some of the work that this Committee was tasked with in the original referral motion. A recent addition to these Principles states: “The business of consensus government should be carried out in public, unless there are compelling reasons to meet in private. Public meetings should be the rule and not the exception.”

The following section has also been added to the protocol:

1. Public Briefings and Meetings with Standing Committees
2. Where Ministers offer or agree to a request to brief a Standing Committee, the briefing will be held in public. If confidential matters are expected to be discussed in the course of the briefing, or if they arise after the briefing has commenced, the Minister or any member of the committee may request that the meeting or a portion of it be held in camera.
3. The decision to hold all or a portion of a briefing in camerarests with the Standing Committee on the understanding that Ministers may be limited in terms of what information they can provide in public.
4. For the purposes of this protocol, confidential matters include:
   1. the draft business plan or budget of a department or public agency prior to their introduction in the Legislative Assembly;
   2. a proposed policy initiative, legislative proposal or bill prior to its formal introduction in the Legislative Assembly;
   3. a personnel matter relating to an employee or statutory officer;
   4. concerns with the performance of a specific Minister; and
   5. any other matter, where a member of the committee or the Minister identifies the matter as one which is, or would likely be, protected by privacy and data protection laws.
5. A motion to hold all or a portion of a committee meeting in camera shall include the nature of the item to be discussed as well as the rationale for discussing the matterin camera.

This section applies only to standing committee meetings where a Minister will be present to brief committee, either at the request of the Minister or committee.

The intent of these provisions is that such meetings are as open to the public as possible, and the committee suggests this principle applies to the work of standing committees in general. The degree will necessarily vary according to the nature of work to be done.

For example, the committee suggests that it is not appropriate to provide public access to committees’ strategic planning, or sessional meetings of the Standing Committee on Priorities and Planning, which focus on preparing for business in the House later in the day.

The measures suggested below would considerably improve upon the information currently available, and provide greater public access to committee work and understanding of it.

As soon as possible, working with Legislative Assembly staff, each standing committee should:

1. Improve the ease-of-use and access to committee web pages and add the following information to what is currently provided:
   1. known schedule, and public matters being considered;
   2. meeting notices, agendas, witnesses’ submissions and presentation materials.

Specific requests for public input and contact information for the committee should be prominently displayed and readily accessible.

1. Identify, in advance, whether a meeting or a portion of a meeting may be held in camera, and how this will be reflected in the agenda. A committee may decide to hold an in camera meeting or portions of a meeting in camera to:

* deal with administrative and personnel matters;
* consider correspondence or a draft report, including the Committee’s own reports;
* receive a background briefing;
* deal with subject matters requiring confidentiality, such as budget items or bills that have not yet been introduced in the Assembly;
* do strategic planning, including sessional meetings of the Standing Committee on Priorities and Planning, which focus on preparing for business in the House; or
* any other matter that would or would likely entail private or privileged information.

3. Ensure that consideration is given to the use of plain language and summaries where appropriate in public communications and reports.

Consistent with the Guiding Principles and Process Conventions, each Committee has the discretion to hold a meeting or a portion of a meeting in camera if it determines that there is a compelling reason to do so.

The committee’s proposals are consistent with the House of Commons Compendium, a guide to specialized procedural topics, which are instructive despite the many differences between committees of Canada’s Parliament and those of our legislature.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I would like to hand this back to the Member for Frame Lake.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Member for Frame Lake.

**MR. O'REILLY:** Mahsi, Mr. Speaker.

**Next Steps**

The Standing Committee on Rules and Procedures will:

1. Consider the potential for existing or emerging technologies to enhance public access to information and public interaction.
2. Do further consultation with individual members of the Legislative Assembly, Chairs of standing committees, GNWT officials, and members of the public and organizations; to elicit input on how to enhance transparency and public engagement in the work done by the Standing Committees.

The committee recognizes that further work should be done to examine a number of issues including:

* What does “public” really mean in the context of meetings and does it include broadcasting?
* What supporting materials for standing committee meetings should be public?
* Should standing committee deliberations and decisions be made in public, and how might that be documented?
* What, if any, standing committee correspondence is public?
* How to ensure consistency of processes and procedures across the standing committees?
* How often and by whom should standing committee procedures be reviewed in light of commitments to more public engagement and transparency?

The committee looks forward to conducting additional research and hearing from the public and Members on these matters. The committee will focus on practical and effective ways our standing committees can improve their transparency and engagement, and provide useful information to the interested public. The Committee plans to report further to the Assembly in June 2017. Mahsi, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Member for Frame Lake.

## Motion to Receive and adopt Committee Report 5-18(2), Carried

**MR. O'REILLY:** Mahsi, Mr. Speaker. I move, seconded by the honourable Member for Nahendeh that Committee Report 5-18(2) be received and adopted by this Assembly. Mahsi, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. There is a motion on the floor. The motion is in order. To the motion. Question has been called. All those in favour?

**MR. O'REILLY:** I'm sorry.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Oh, sorry. Member for Frame Lake.

**MR. O'REILLY:** Mahsi, Mr. Speaker. I'll keep this very short; I know we've had a long day here and probably go for a bit longer, but I did want to acknowledge and thank the committee members who worked on this report. We've done a lot of work together. I think we've had more meetings than any of the other standing committees. It's a huge relief to me personally to have this off my desk and a lot of personal satisfaction. So I want to recognize the work of the committee members: the honourable Member for Thebacha, the Member for Yellowknife Centre, the Member for Nahendeh and the Member for Tu Nedhe-Wiilideh.

We did seek input from Caucus as well, all of the Regular Members, back in August on our retreat, and I don't think we shifted direction in any substantive way. We did look at the concepts of public engagement. We reviewed our current activities, how it's done in other jurisdictions. We've made some interim recommendations in here and we hope to do some further work.

I think it's really important that the public and the media understand the fundamental changes that will take place now in how we conduct our business as a result of the changes to the Guiding Principles and Process Conventions and the tabling of this report in this House. We are fundamentally changing the way that we do our business as a Legislative Assembly. I don't think it's actually sunk in for us all, but now the default is that we will do our business in public rather than in private meetings. We will continue to have private meetings where necessary but we will start off our meetings in public and they will go in camera but for specified reasons. That's a very fundamental shift in how we do our business, and I can't emphasize that enough.

I mentioned, though, at the conclusion of our report that we are seeking further input on matters, including what's really meant by public meetings; what sort of supporting materials are to be made public as part of standing committee meetings; deliberations and decisions by standing committees, whether those should be done in public and how they should be documented; committee correspondence, should that be made public; how we ensure consistency across our standing committees and how we should regularly review our public engagement and transparency as standing committees.

So we do welcome further input from the public, the media, and our Regular Members, of course, all Members of this House, and we do expect to have a final report in 2017. Mahsi, Mr. Speaker, and I look forward to further discussion about these important matters.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Mahsi. To the motion. Question has been called. The motion is carried.

---Carried

Committee Report 5-18(2) has been received and adopted by this Assembly. Masi, colleagues.

Item 4, reports of standing and special committee. Item 5, returns to oral questions. Item 6, recognition of visitors in the gallery. Item 7, acknowledgements. Item 8, oral questions. Item 9, written questions. Item 10, returns to written questions. Item 11, replies to Commissioner's opening address. Item 12, petitions. Item 13, reports of committees on the review of bills. Item 14, tabling of documents. Minister for Industry, Tourism and Investment.

# Tabling of Documents

## Tabled Document 208-18(2): Government of the Northwest Territories Contracts over $5,000 Report for the Fiscal Year Ending March 31, 2016

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Mr. Speaker, I wish to table the following document entitled "Government of the Northwest Territories Contracts over $5,000 Report for the Fiscal Year Ending March 31, 2016." Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Tabling of documents. Minister responsible for the Northwest Territories Power Corporation.

## Tabled Document 209-18(2): Northwest Territories Hydro Corporation and Northwest Territories Power Corporation 2016 Annual Report

## Tabled Document 210-18(2): Northwest Territories Hydro Corporation and Northwest Territories Power Corporation 2016-2017 Corporate Plan

## Tabled Document 211-18(2): Northwest Territories Coroner Service 2015 Annual Report

**HON. LOUIS SEBERT:** Mr. Speaker, I wish to table the following three documents entitled "Northwest Territories Hydro Corporation and Northwest Territories Power Corporation 2016 Annual Report," "Northwest Territories Hydro Corporation and Northwest Territories Power Corporation 2016-2017 Corporate Plan," and "Northwest Territories Coroner Service 2015 Annual Report." Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Tabling of documents. Minister of Education, Culture and Employment.

## Tabled Document 212-18(2): Government of the Northwest Territories Annual Report on Official Languages 2015-2016

**HON. ALFRED MOSES:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I wish to table the following document entitled "Annual Report on Official Languages 2015-2016." Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Tabling of documents. Minister of Health and Social Services.

## Tabled Document 213-18(2): Follow-up Letter to Oral Question 312-18(2): Managed Alcohol Programs

**HON. GLEN ABERNETHY:** Mr. Speaker, I wish to table the following document entitled "Follow-up Letter to Oral Question 312-18(2) Managed Alcohol Programs." Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Tabling of documents. Member for Frame Lake.

## Tabled Document 214-18(2): Correspondence from the City of Yellowknife to the Minister of Municipal and Community Affairs Requesting Legislative Changes

## Tabled Document 215-18(2): The Northern Way Hybrid Micro-grids Improving Energy Security through a Northern Alternative to Carbon Pricing

**MR. O'REILLY:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I wish to table two documents. The first one is a Letter from the City of Yellowknife to the Minister of Municipal and Community Affairs regarding a Municipal request for legislative changes. The second document, Mr. Speaker, is called "The Northern Way Hybrid Micro-grids Improving Energy Security Through a Northern Alternative to Carbon Pricing.” Mahsi, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Tabling of documents. Item 15, notices of motion. Item 16, notices of motion for first reading of bills. Item 17, motions. Item 18, first reading of bills. Item 19, second reading of bills. Item 20, consideration in Committee of the Whole of bills and other matters, Tabled Document 143-18(2) and Tabled Document 163-18(2) with the Member for Hay River North in the Chair.

# Consideration in Committee of the Whole of Bills and Other Matters

**CHAIRPERSON: (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. What is the wish of Committee? Mr. Beaulieu.

**MR. BEAULIEU:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, committee would like to consider Tabled Document 143-18(2), Capital Estimates 2017-2018, and Tabled Document 163-18(2), Capital Estimates, 2017-2018 for the Department of Public Works and Services and Department of Transportation, and committee would like to consider the Department of Transportation today. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

**CHAIRPERSON: (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Beaulieu. Does committee agree?

**SOME HON. MEMBERS:** Agreed.

**CHAIRPERSON: (Mr. Simpson):** Committee will take a very, very brief break and we will resume with consideration of the documents.

---SHORT RECESS

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** I now call Committee of the Whole back to order. Committee, we have agreed to consider Tabled Document 163-18(2), Capital Estimates 2017-2018 for the Department of Public Works and Services and the Department of Transportation. We will continue with the Department of Transportation, which begins on page DOT-1. We will defer consideration of the departmental total until after we consider the activity summaries. So would committee please turn to page DOT-2, asset management, with associated detail on pages 3 and 4. But first, committee, I would like to ask the Minister of Transportation if he has any opening remarks.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** No, I do not.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** I would like to invite the Minister to bring any witnesses he has into the Chamber.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Yes, I would.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Sergeant-at-Arms, please escort the witnesses into the Chamber. Minister, would you please introduce your witnesses to the committee.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. On my left is Deputy Minister Russ Neudorf and on my right is Assistant Deputy Minister Jayleen Robertson.

**CHAIRPERSON: (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Welcome to the witnesses. I'd like to open the floor to general comments. Do we have general comments on the Department of Transportation? I see none. We will now continue to page DOT-1 where the Department of Transportation begins. We will defer consideration of the departmental total until after the activity summary which begins on page DOT-2 with associated details on page 3 and 4. Comments or questions. Mr. Vanthuyne.

**MR. VANTHUYNE:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chair, on DOT-4, Highway No. 4 reconstruction is noted in here and so I know that isn’t detail and it doesn't provide descriptive substantiations here, but, Mr. Chair, we're aware that the City of Yellowknife along with territorial government, the Yellowknives Dene and a couple other stakeholders are involved in the Capital City Site Area Committee which oversees the grounds within the periphery of Frame Lake area, and a section of Highway No. 4 is within that periphery, and recently the City of Yellowknife had the opportunity to come and present to the Board of Management in a public meeting about the recommendations that they're putting forth for that Capital Site Committee to invest in in the coming years.

The actual report identified a potential crosswalk to be had on Section 4, kind of where I've recommended in the past where it would between the new hotel entranceway and the entranceway to the Legislative Assembly.

So I'm just wondering if the Minister could maybe share with us any detail that might be under -- now that the Board of Management has kind of approved the capital site area plan to go forward, can we get some insight from the Minister on what might be expected from the department and what role they might play in supporting that plan, and in particular public safety along that stretch of highway and maybe even more detail if possible with regard to the potential for a crosswalk there? Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON: (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Vanthuyne. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. Since actually the Member has asked questions in the House, we've had consultation with the City of Yellowknife on the access road to the city, and we've presented a plan and had conversation with him about putting a trail from the power generation power utility piece there close to Niven and a trail along the side of the highway in front of Nova with a crosswalk, and we're just waiting to hear back from the City of Yellowknife. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. Vanthuyne.

**MR. VANTHUYNE:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. Just for clarification, we're waiting to hear back from the City of Yellowknife with regard to what? Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Vanthuyne. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. We're waiting to hear back from the City of Yellowknife with the plan we presented, and also I forget to mention we're waiting to hear back from the developer of the site because some of the trail may cross or impeded onto his property as well. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. Vanthuyne.

**MR. VANTHUYNE:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. So just if I may with your indulgence get into a little bit more detail. So who will be building the trail? Who will be maintaining the trail? Who will be building the crosswalk? Who will pay for the crosswalk? Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Vanthuyne. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. We will be building a RFP to build a trail. We are paying for the crosswalk and the city will be maintaining the trail. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. Vanthuyne.

**MR. VANTHUYNE:** That's great, Mr. Chair. Thank you. Nothing further.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Vanthuyne. Mr. Beaulieu.

**MR. BEAULIEU:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, I would like to ask the Minister on Highway No. 6 reconstruction if at the end of this fiscal year, 2017-2018, if the reconstruction of Highway No. 6 will be completed? Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Beaulieu. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. No, it will not be completed this year. We'll be going into 2018-2019 to finish that project. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. Beaulieu.

**MR. BEAULIEU:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, I'd like to ask the Minister about the bridge rehab replacement talking about -- I guess I now have an interest in Frank Channel, Hay River to Pine Point and Buffalo River. I want to know what is scheduled for rehabilitation and replacement this year from those three bridges? Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Beaulieu. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. I'll pass this one onto Deputy Minister Neudorf please.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. Neudorf.

**MR. NEUDORF:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. Yes, this year we started on the Buffalo River Bridge rehab. We are also doing the design and preparing tender documents for the Frank Channel and the Jean Marie River Bridge, and then next year, 2017-2018, we'll complete Buffalo River Bridge and get started on Frank Channel and Jean Marie. We'll begin the design work on the Hay River to Pine Point Bridge as well. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Neudorf. Mr. Beaulieu.

**MR. BEAULIEU:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, that's all the questions I have for now.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Beaulieu. Mr. O'Reilly.

**MR. O'REILLY:** Thanks, Mr. Chair. I just wanted to follow up with the Minister on the Highway No. 4 reconstruction, and I appreciate his commitment on behalf of the department to do the work on the stretch of highway near Niven Lake. Half of that's in my riding as well. So just to be clear, that work is scheduled then for 2017-2018 out of the capital budget? Is that where the funding's coming from? Thanks, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. O'Reilly. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. We want to actually proceed with this work and we want to try to actually proceed and have the work done in the next couple of months. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Mr. O'Reilly.

**MR. O'REILLY:** Thanks, Mr. Chair. That's great news because I know there's been a lot of public concerns expressed about that particular stretch of the highway and given that the hotel is operating and there's a lot of tourists that are going to cross the highway to get into the visitors centre as well. That's great news, but I'm just wondering does the Minister see the -- look I don’t want to slow this work down and I don’t think the department does either, but is there an opportunity to at least present the design to folks like the Northern Frontier Visitors Centre, the folks that have the hotel, some of the residents of Niven subdivision to just get some feedback on it before it goes ahead? Because there's been a lot of public interest in this stretch of highway and I think people will want to see what the design is and at least have the ability to offer some feedback. Thanks, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. O'Reilly. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. The department has already talked to the developer and the visitors centre, so they're well aware of what's moving forward. What the city's been asked to do is to engage the citizens of Yellowknife and particularly the residents of Niven, so that's their responsibility. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. O'Reilly.

**MR. O'REILLY:** Great. Thanks, Mr. Chair. I appreciate that and I think the city does do good public consultation work, so in collaboration with you folks, you know, I have a lot of confidence that there'll be an opportunity then for the folks in Niven Lake in particular to express their ideas about the design and that, so thank you very much. I appreciate that commitment.

I just want to move on if I can, Mr. Chair, to a different matter. I noticed on page 3 that there's this site runway stabilization using EK35 which is a dust suppressant, so it just made me wonder what sort of dust suppressants do we use on the highways? Is it just calcium chloride and water of course, but is there anything else that we use because I know EK35 is just for runways because it's approved by aircraft manufacturers. You don’t want to damage the aircraft stuff, but for the highways, is it just calcium chloride and water? Then I might have another question, if I can. Thanks, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. O'Reilly. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. The Member is absolutely correct, calcium chloride is what we use on the highways, EK35 is used on runways due to the nature that it doesn't corrode the aircraft. Calcium chloride is significantly cheaper than EK35. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. O'Reilly.

**MR. O'REILLY:** Thanks, Mr. Chair. I know that at least one of the diamond mines has been using some other dust suppressants. Just wondering whether there's been any conversations between the department and the diamond mines in terms of the effectiveness of these other dust suppressants? Thanks, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. O'Reilly. I'd like everyone to keep in mind this is the capital budget, not O and M, but I'll let the Minister respond.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. I don't believe we had conversations with the diamond mines. But there's been a different amount of studies done with the communities and looking at different options, and at the end of the day calcium chloride's still the cheapest, most viable option. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. O'Reilly.

**MR. O'REILLY:** Thanks, Mr. Chair. Yes, I'd encourage the department to talk to the diamond mines about their dust suppression activities. I think it is important that we use this opportunity in Committee of the Whole to ask these sort of questions in spite of some resistance perhaps from the other side. But we're here to talk about these capital expenditures and I'll use that opportunity. Thanks, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. O'Reilly. Mr. Thompson.

**MR. THOMPSON:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. Just to go back to a comment that was made regarding bridges. Could the Minister please clarify, because I was looking at the business plan, there was some talk about the Jean Marie River Bridge being looked at. Could the Minister please confirm that this is going to be looked at? Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Thompson. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. Yes, the Jean Marie, if you want to talk about that specific bridge, the pre-engineering design and tender will be done in 2016-2017 and construction will be done in 2017-2018. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. Thompson.

**MR. THOMPSON:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. I thank the Minister for that answer. In regards to that road, and the next bridge is the Trout River Bridge, and I've been on it a couple times and I've seen pylons and access limited to one side. Has the department looked at this as part of the capital plan? Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Thompson. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** I'll defer that to Mr. Neudorf. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. Neudorf.

**MR. NEUDORF:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. We do have quite an extensive bridge management system that we look at all of our bridges on a regular basis and determine their condition; that goes into our management system and it helps us prioritize the improvements that are required. So there's no plan for the Trout River Bridge at this point in time in the capital plan. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Neudorf. Mr. Thompson.

**MR. THOMPSON:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. I thank Mr. Neudorf for his answer. Could maybe the Minister explain what was the issue by having it only open to one lane if they're not going to be looking at doing capital on it? Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Thompson. Mr. Neudorf.

**MR. NEUDORF:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. As part of that, we did an engineering study on that bridge and determined, as we have done with other bridges, as they were designed 40-50 years ago, they were designed for different vehicles that operate than the truck today and we find that on occasion we do need to put restrictions on; not weight restrictions per se, but speed restrictions for the most part just so that we can ensure that we can maximize the remaining life of the bridges. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Neudorf. Mr. Thompson.

**MR. THOMPSON:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. I'd like to go on to another area regarding Highway No. 1. The highway goes from the border all the way up to Wrigley. So could the Minister please explain exactly what section of the roads are going to be looked at through this fiscal plan? Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Thompson. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. Proposed work for 2017-2018 is embankment widening improvements at kilometre 379 to 375, which is involving aggregate production, widening, strengthening and surface preparation. Drainage improvements also on the same kilometres, 379 to 375. Correction, aggregate production in pit at kilometres 389 to 375.6, and then again chip seal is going to be done on the same section, 395 to 375. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. Thompson.

**MR. THOMPSON:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. I'm a little confused with what just the section of the road is. I guess I'm trying to understand 379 to 375, is that from what section? What section of that road is it closer to? Is it closer to Wrigley or is it closer to Fort Simpson, or Providence or Hay River? Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Thompson. Could the Minister give us a description of where this piece of road is relative to the communities? Mr. Neudorf rather.

**MR. NEUDORF:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. At the end of the day, at the end of the money that's in the budget for 2017-2018 we hope to have chip sealed from kilometre 375 to 395, and 375 is the Jean Marie River access road where the community's access road joins Highway No. 1, so that stretch would be entire chip sealed then from the access road into Checkpoint. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Neudorf. Mr. Thompson.

**MR. THOMPSON:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. I guess I'm a little concerned that we still haven't looked at that from Ndulee crossing to Wrigley. That section of the road, there needs to be some work done on that. So if it's not in this capital plan this year, when do we look at it being put in the capital plan? Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Thompson. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. The section of road that the Member's asking for is not in the capital plan in this fiscal year. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. Thompson.

**MR. THOMPSON:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. I thank the Minister for that answer. I guess the second part is if it's not part of this year's plan, when are we looking at fixing the section of the road? Because I've been up and down that road a few times and some days it's good and some days it's an interesting drive. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Thompson. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. The challenge moving forward is to get enough funding to do all these sections of roads across the Northwest Territories, and as we move forward we will try to round up the funding that we can do this section of road. But moving forward in the short-term, there is no money to do this section. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. Thompson.

**MR. THOMPSON:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. I'll try to move on to Highway No. 7. Could the Minister give a little bit more elaboration on what's happening on Highway No. 7? That's from Checkpoint to the B.C. border. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Thompson. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. The proposed work for 2017-2018 on this section of road is produce stockpile material at pit kilometre 75, resurfacing and distress repair from kilometre 53 to 69, and drainage improvements from kilometre 53 to 69. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. Thompson.

**MR. THOMPSON:** I thank the Minister for that answer, and my colleague for bringing it to my attention where it was, so I thank him for that. Just the last one, the Lafferty Hall upgrade, when will this work be done? Is it going to be after the season is over or before the season is over? Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Thompson. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. That will all happen before next season, so probably next spring. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. Thompson.

**MR. THOMPSON:** Thank you, Mr. Chair, and I thank the Minister for his answer. I believe this will be the last question, unless he gives me a different answer. Is this going out to contract or is this going to be done by the local staff? Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Thompson. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. That will be going out to tender. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. I see nothing further from Mr. Thompson. Next I have Mr. Blake.

**MR. BLAKE:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. Just a couple of questions here. On Highway No. 8, I know we completed a lot of the widening from the border to Fort McPherson, and I was just wondering what the plans are for next year? I know a lot of this has been done, but there is still a number of kilometres that aren't quite finished just because of the crushed gravel that needs to be capped on top of it. I'd just like to know what the plans are for the department on that? Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Blake. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. On the 2016-2017, we're just finishing up the brushing and drainage culvert replacements. What we need for the 2017-2018, we're going to do surface gravel from kilometre 30 to 70 and brushing from 154 to 159, and serving and design kilometre 143 to 154. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. Blake.

**MR. BLAKE:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. That sounds good. The replacement of the James Creek Highway Maintenance Camp, I'm glad to see that's finally on the books here. I'm just wondering if the department would be willing to work with whether it's Gwich'in Tribal Council or the community, if they're willing to negotiate this contract, would the department be open to that? Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Blake. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. As this is a federally funded program, chances are that this is going to have to be publicly tendered. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. Blake.

**MR. BLAKE:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. I think we set a precedent here with federal funding. As you all, the Inuvik-Tuk Highway wasn't put out to tender, so you know, it can be possible to negotiate contracts under the Building Canada as it was with the Inuvik-Tuk Highway. So would the department be willing to do that? Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Blake. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. One of the options we consider is the remediation work of the old site that has to be decommissioned and cleaned up once a new building is built.

The Treasury Board from the federal government has put new rules in place when they give us money for some of these bundles, and part of it is they want to see most of this stuff go to public tender. If we were ever to even consider a negotiated contract, there would have to be a resubmission with a business plan and everything going back to the federal government, and chances are that it could go either way, if they would approve it or disapprove it. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Mr. Blake.

**MR. BLAKE:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. It's not what I wanted to hear, but at least there's an opportunity for the community to do the remediation work. I'm sure that will be a job in itself, there. Just under bridges, here, I was hoping to see Willow River under there, but it didn't happen this year. Hopefully next year.

The department is doing so well that I think to just fund the remainder of Willow River would really help the community of Aklavik. You know, we're so close to being finished with this project, and I'd just like to see that finished hopefully this year. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Blake. Minister.

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. I'd love to see it within bundle No. 3, too, but I don't believe that's going to happen. Moving forward, we have a great infrastructure deficit in the Northwest Territories, as I've said before in this House.

We could spend every dollar that the federal government has committed to transportation across the country and we'd never meet the deficit of the infrastructure of highways in the Northwest Territories. So moving forward we have to make the best use of our money and we will continue to do so. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. Anything further, Mr. Blake?

**MR. BLAKE:** No, that's about it. That will do the remainer of this. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Blake. Next, Mr. Nakimayak.

**MR. NAKIMAYAK:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. Just on page DOT-3, the Inuvik to Tuktoyaktuk all-weather highway. I just wanted a few details on that, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Nakimayak. Minister

**HON. WALLY SCHUMANN:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. This particular item is to finish up the granular and the gravel on the Inuvik-Tuk Highway. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Minister. I see nothing further. Do we have any further comments or questions? Seeing none. We will return to page DOT-2. I will call the page. Transportation, asset management, infrastructure investments, $79,494,000. Does committee agree?

**SOME HON. MEMBERS:** Agreed.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, committee. We will turn to page DOT-5, programs and services, with the associated detail on page DOT-6. Do we have comments or questions on either of these pages? Seeing none. I'll call the page. Transportation, programs and services, infrastructure investments $200,000. Does committee agree?

**SOME HON. MEMBERS:** Agreed.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, committee. Please return to page DOT-1. Transportation, total capital estimates, $79,694,000. Does committee agree?

**SOME HON. MEMBERS:** Agreed.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, committee. Does committee agree that we have now concluded consideration of the Department of Transportation?

**SOME HON. MEMBERS:** Agreed.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** I would like to thank the Minister and his witnesses for appearing before us. Sergeant-at-Arms, please escort the witnesses from the Chamber. Now, does committee agree that consideration of Tabled Document 163-18(2) is concluded?

**SOME HON. MEMBERS:** Agreed.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, committee. Mr. Beaulieu.

## Committee Motion 36-18(2): Concurrence of Tabled Document 163-18(2): Capital Estimates, 2017-2018 for the Department of Public Works and Services and Department of Transportation, Carried

**MR. BEAULIEU:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, I move that consideration of Tabled Document 163-18(2), Capital Estimates 2017-2018 for the Department of Public Works and Services and the Department of Transportation now be concluded and that Tabled Document 163-18(2) be reported and recommended as ready for further consideration in formal session through the form of an appropriation bill. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Beaulieu. The motion is in order. To the motion.

---Carried

Committee, we have agreed to return to consideration of Tabled Document 143-18(2) as amended. Does committee agree that consideration of Tabled Document 143-18(2) as amended is concluded?

**SOME HON. MEMBERS:** Agreed.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Mr. Beaulieu.

## Committee Motion 37-18(2): Concurrence of Tabled Document 143-18(2): Capital Estimates, 2017-2018 as Amended, Carried

**MR. BEAULIEU:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, I move that consideration of Tabled Document 143-18(2), Capital Estimates, 2017-2018 be now concluded, and that Tabled Document 143-18(2) be reported as amended and recommended as ready for further consideration in formal session through the form of an appropriation bill. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson):** Thank you, Mr. Beaulieu. The motion is in order. To the motion. All those in favour? All those opposed? Motion is carried.

---Carried

Now what is the wish of committee? Mr. Beaulieu.

**MR. BEAULIEU:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, I move that we report progress.

**CHAIRPERSON (Mr. Simpson)**: Thank you, Mr. Beaulieu. There is a motion on the floor to report progress. The motion is in order and non-debatable. All those in favour? All those opposed? The motion is carried.

---Carried

I will now rise and report progress.

**MR. SPEAKER:** May I have the report from the Member for Hay River North.

# Report of Committee of the Whole

**MR. SIMPSON:** Mr. Speaker, your committee has been considering Tabled Document 143-18(2), Capital Estimates, 2017-2018, and Tabled Document 163-18(2), Capital Estimates 2017-2018, for the Department of Public Works and Services and the Department of Transportation and would like to report that consideration of Tabled Document 143-18(2), as amended and Tabled Document 163-18(2) is concluded and that the House concur in those combined estimates as amended and that an appropriation bill based thereon be introduced without delay, and Mr. Speaker, I move that the report of Committee of the Whole be concurred with. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Do we have a seconder? Member for Hay River South. Motion is on the floor. The motion is in order. All those in favour? All those opposed? The motion is carried.

---Carried

**MR. SPEAKER:** Item 22, third reading of bills. Minister of Finance.

# Third Reading of Bills

## BILL 11: Supplementary Appropriation Act (Operations Expenditures), No. 1, 2016-2017

**HON. ROBERT MCLEOD:** Thank you, Mr. Chair. Mr. Chair, I move, seconded by the honourable Member for Hay River South, that Bill 11, Supplementary Appropriation Act (Operations Expenditures), No. 1, 2016-2017, be read for the third time. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Member for Kam Lake.

**MR. TESTART:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I'd like to request a recorded vote.

## RECORDED VOTE

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. Member requested a recorded vote. All those in favour, please stand.

**CLERK OF THE HOUSE (Mr. Mercer):** The Member for Inuvik Twin Lakes, the Member for Hay River South, the Member for Thebacha, the Member for Hay River North, the Member for Mackenzie Delta, the Member for Sahtu, the Member for Yellowknife North, the Member for Kam Lake, the Member for Tu Nedhe-Wiilideh, the Member for Nahendeh, the Member for Frame Lake, the Member for Yellowknife Centre, the Member for Deh Cho, the Member for Nunakput, the Member for Inuvik Boot Lake, the Member for Great Slave, the Member for Yellowknife South.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. All those opposed, please stand. All those abstaining, please stand. All those in favour, 17; opposed, zero; abstentions, zero. Motion carried.

---Carried

**MR. SPEAKER:** Bill 11 has had its third reading and is now ready for assent. Minister of Finance.

## Bill 12: Supplementary Appropriation Act (Infrastructure Expenditures), No. 2, 2016-2017

**HON. ROBERT MCLEOD:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I move, seconded by the honourable Member for Yellowknife South, that Bill 12, Supplementary Appropriation Act (Infrastructure Expenditures), No. 2, 2016-2017 be read for the third time. Thank you, Mr. Speaker, and, Mr. Speaker, I request a recorded vote.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. There has been a request for a recorded vote on Bill 12. All those in favour, please stand.

**CLERK OF THE HOUSE (Mr. Mercer):** The Member for Inuvik Twin Lakes, the Member for Hay River South, the Member for Thebacha, the Member for Hay River North, the Member for Mackenzie Delta, the Member for Sahtu, the Member for Yellowknife North, the Member for Kam Lake, the Member for Tu Nedhe-Wiilideh, the Member for Nahendeh, the Member for Frame Lake, the Member for Yellowknife Centre, the Member for Deh Cho, the Member for Nunakput, the Member for Inuvik Boot Lake, the Member for Great Slave, the Member for Yellowknife South.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi. All those opposed, please stand. All those abstaining, please stand. All those in favour, 17; opposed, zero; abstentions, zero. Motion carried.

---Carried

Bill 12 has had its third reading and is now ready for assent.

Third reading of bills. Mr. Clerk, orders of the day.

# Orders of the Day

**CLERK OF THE HOUSE (Mr. Mercer):** Orders of the day for Wednesday, November 2, 2016, at 1:30 p.m.:

1. Prayer
2. Ministers’ Statements
3. Members’ Statements
4. Returns to Oral Questions
5. Recognition of Visitors in the Gallery
6. Acknowledgements
7. Oral Questions
8. Written Questions
9. Returns to Written Questions
10. Replies to the Commissioner’s Opening Address
11. Petitions
12. Reports of Standing and Special Committees
13. Reports of Committees on the Review of Bills
14. Tabling of Documents
15. Notices of Motion
16. Notices of Motion for First Reading of Bills
17. Motions

* Motion 27-18(2), A New Day Men’s Healing Program

1. First Reading of Bills

* Bill 13, Marriage Act

1. Second Reading of Bills
2. Consideration in Committee of the Whole of Bills and Other Matters
3. Report of Committee of the Whole
4. Third Reading of Bills
5. Orders of the Day

**MR. SPEAKER:** Masi, Mr. Clerk. This House stands adjourned until Wednesday, November 2, 2016, at 1:30 p.m.

---ADJOURNMENT

The House adjourned at 4:58 p.m.